



Digital Transparency in the Public Realm

Online Discovery Session Report Out
August, 2019

Smart**Cities**Council® Liveability
Australia New Zealand Workability
Sustainability

Introduction

The Smart Cities Council recently brought together government stakeholders and Smart Cities Council members to discuss current issues around the use of technology and the collection of data in the public realm. From deployment of CCTV and IoT devices, to the practice of growing data capture capabilities and storage, we acknowledge we are reaching an unprecedented level of investment, interest and uncertainty in how we design, deploy and manage digital transformation in the public realm.

This online discovery session around digital transparency in the public realm for government and industry across Australia and New Zealand was an intensive 2-hour discussion involving a diversity of question sets structured through an online interactive portal. The dialogue generated resulted from some of the following prompting questions we asked:

- What technologies/systems are you deploying?
- What standards/guidance are you using?
- What's your level of confidence in deployment?
- What project support are you getting?
- What are your privacy strategies?
- What's your biggest concern?
- What's your biggest barrier to success?

The group of more than 30 stakeholders identified common interests and challenges, and some potential pathways forward in developing and accessing guidance and support.

Transparency and privacy were two key items discussed at length - particularly the differences between the two, and how each are governed by law, or not. The key is then translating this to how our investment in the public realm and making our public spaces and places vibrant and prosperous, plays out.

Outcomes

Using an online interactive portal, the session participants were able to provide rapid feedback and prioritisation of responses to a suite of key questions. After each question session the participants engaged in discussion to further unpack and challenge the issues identified.

The following pages are the response boards from the question sets.

Digital Transparency in the Public Realm Technology, trust and the public realm...

What are you doing that might be relevant to this topic?	What isn't going so well?	What have you learned?	What do we need help with, what do we need to do?
Data services around Location Insights 0 0 0	A lot of poor advice being delivered to LGAs from so-called experts 0 0 0	Transparency is our greatest opportunity to keep government's accountable and thus be better. 12 0 0	A streamlined and clear framework for data governance and transparency/privacy laws. A set of rules that can be mandated and applied to help direct the future movement of the smart space. International and Federal clear and adaptable guidelines. 4 0 0
Audio capture functionality with CCTV 0 0 0	Collecting data for the sake of collecting data with no specific purpose. 1 0 0	Whatever you do, do it to make a real difference. 4 0 0	Training for local governments re: how the privacy laws that apply to them impact their smart city initiatives 4 0 0
Using CCTV to count pedestrians and traffic in CBD 3 0 0	Lack of Privacy by Design: Cities deploying smart technologies/ initiatives before doing their privacy homework. This means privacy is not being "built in"... it is being "bolted on". 5 0 1	You don't have to be a data scientist to understand data 3 0 0	Help everyone understand that learning-by-doing is necessary so rather than wait, make a start on the data journey. Start simple and learn. 4 0 0
Ensuring digital policy and approach to data management is in accordance with privacy and security requirements 4 0 0	getting our local Councillors to understand this issue and not a "just get it done" mentality 2 0 0	Engage others - don't operate in silos 2 0 0	national data exchange platform to provide a single data market-place for government and private sector building a data economy and maximising transparency 3 0 0
Privacy Impact Assessments 4 0 0	the appreciation of the importance of trust preserving data sharing is very patchy. Some councils understand the need while others have no idea yet. 0 0 0	Privacy/ protection of personal information must be treated as an opportunity to build and maintain community trust - rather than a road-block or something that hampers innovation. 2 0 0	Data transparency protocol - the same language and framework used everywhere 2 0 0
working with NSW Data Analytics Centre to develop trust preserving data sharing model for standardisation 0 0 0	politically motivated data sharing - dat swarms, where dat is technically available but too hard to access and use 1 0 0	Wear your citizen hat as often as you can 2 0 0	OPEN BUDGET DATA - show how peoples money is spent and what the outcomes are 2 0 0
Advising on 5G to Local Governments which directly introduces the heightened need for data sharing 1 0 0	General education and awareness around privacy. Not all data collected about the public realm is personal data. 8 0 0	I am not alone with my concerns about the privacy and responsibility issues however there is no one solution or framework for consistency of response and management. 0 0 0	Governments need to much better understand IoT and the implications on the entire economy. 2 0 0
Installing and trialing LoRaWAN gateways. 0 0 0	Clear and concise, non-political, benefit-oriented communication to the public from those pushing for digital transparency. 0 0 0	the people who are most reluctant to join the data privacy/transparency conversation are the people we need the most. 0 0 0	that you can't predict how ill-informed people will 0 0 0
Delivering an Open Community Data Exchange to make data available to the community 5 0 0			
Developing privacy/security policy and architecture in public sector plus supporting industries. Also 0 0 0			

The image above is a screenshot of the online portal used to gather feedback. It is not a complete image.

Digital Transparency in the Public Realm - Discovery Session (12.08.19)

What are you doing that might be relevant to this topic?

Data services around Location Insights (0 votes)
Audio capture functionality with CCTV (0 votes)
Using CCTV to count pedestrians and traffic in CBD (3 votes)
Ensuring digital policy and approach to data management is in accordance with privacy and security requirements
Privacy Impact Assessments (4 votes)
working with NSW Data Analytics Centre to develop trust preserving data sharing model for standardisation (0 votes)
Advising on 5G to Local Governments which directly introduces the heightened need for data sharing (1 votes)
Installing and trialing LoRaWAN gateways. (0 votes)
Delivering an Open Community Data Exchange to make data available to the community (5 votes)
Developing privacy/security policy and architecture in public sector plus supporting industries. Also implementing technology platforms, IoT, data analytics, ERP etc. (3 votes)
Sidewalk labs data transparency protocol (3 votes)
Releasing Council data as open at data.gov.au - typically spatial information (3 votes)
Capturing data about public space use and behaviour using big data/ social data (0 votes)
Supporting a more effective and accountable range of governments though by enabling appropriate transparency of data. (3 votes)
Strategic frameworks for gov. & private industry groups re: open data application and governance, digital transformation and smart city planning (0 votes)
Data program to leverage collective community intelligence and mitigate transparency concerns (4 votes)
Collecting people data including public wi-fi and CCTV (1 votes)

Installing CCTV cameras as well as Bluetooth detection units (0 votes)
Advisory around technology deployment with relevant implications - tracking people movement via CCTV, WiFi etc (0 votes)
Air and thermal comfort testing (0 votes)
Reviewing the position of cities in terms of privacy governance strategic privacy advisory work (1 votes)
Data governance framework to establish Civic Data Trust (4 votes)
Collaboration with data services around Open Data (1 votes)
Live streaming Council meetings (1 votes)
Data analytics platforms, data lake etc (1 votes)
Developing and deploying Data Sharing Policy and Risk assessment of data (3 votes)
AIQS has developed a Digital Innovation Committee to look all things digital that is and will impact built environment cost. (0 votes)

What isn't going so well?

A lot of poor advice being delivered to LGAs from so-called experts (0 votes)
Collecting data for the sake of collecting data with no specific purpose. (1 votes)
Lack of Privacy-by-Design: Cities deploying smart technologies/ initiatives before doing their privacy homework. This means privacy is not being "built in"... it is being "bolted on". (5 votes)
<p>Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This is the eternal cyber challenge also. I've come to the conclusion "Secure by Design" is a nice aspiration. We should get as close to it as possible but not expect to achieve it
getting our local Councillors to understand this issue and not a "just get it done" mentality (2 votes)
the appreciation of the importance of trust preserving data sharing is very patchy. Some councils understand the need while others have no idea yet. (0 votes)

politically motivated data sharing - dat swamps, where dat is technically available but too hard to access and use (1 votes)
General education and awareness around privacy. Not all data collected about the public realm is personal data. (8 votes)
Clear and concise, non-political, benefit-oriented communication to the public from those pushing for digital transparency. (1 votes)
Need to update legislation to keep up with GDPR (3 votes)
Communication (particularly public communication) around benefits of data and why it should be collected. ---
Outdated legislation - GDPR... (5 votes)
Approach to projects does not include privacy, governance etc. (1 votes)
We've forgotten the customer - the tax payer. (1 votes)
Wrong definitions of Community engagement (needs got be at at a program and governance level - not surveys asking questions) (2 votes)
Privacy commissioners not experienced with the impact of IoT related data issues. (1 votes)
Consistency across LGAs, states and beyond (1 votes)
There is great work happening to standardize data sharing but its very slow progress to global standardized approach. (0 votes)
Lack of data ownership (2 votes)

What have you learned?

Transparency is our greatest opportunity to keep government's accountable and thus be better. (12 votes)
Whatever you do, do it to make a real difference (4 votes)
You don't have to be a data scientist to understand data (3 votes)
Engage others - don't operate in silo's (2 votes)
Privacy/ protection of personal information must be treated as an opportunity to build and maintain community trust - rather than a road-block or something that hampers innovation. (2 votes)
Wear your citizen hat as often as you can (2 votes)

I am not alone with my concerns about the privacy and responsibility issues however there is no one solution or framework for consistency of response and management (0 votes)

the people who are most reluctant to join the data privacy/transparency conversation are the people we need the most. (0 votes)

that you can't predict how ill-informed people will react. People are seldom rational (0 votes)

We need to think about what's going on under the hood - the algorithms, direct database calls, dataset transfers, increasingly automated smart contracts etc - as the "transparent" data exchange is just the iceberg's tip (1 votes)

Councils are held to different standards than bigger more encompassing data aggregators like FB & Google (2 votes)

Hiring data scientists is not the most important thing to do to extract value from data. (0 votes)

take the time to explain the narrative of the outcome of what you do (0 votes)

We all need a level of understanding of data management (0 votes)

Data sharing is complex and effects all agencies in all sectors. But most people are looking for simple solutions.....not good enough (1 votes)

There can never be enough "handholding" to help both the spotting of opportunities but also the understanding of risks (0 votes)

What do we need help with, what do we need to do?

A streamlined and clear framework for data governance and transparency/privacy laws. A set of rules that can be mandated and applied to help direct the future movement of the smart space. International and Federal clear and adaptable guidelines. (4 votes)

Training for local governments re: how the privacy laws that apply to them impact their smart city initiatives (4 votes)

Help everyone understand that learning-by-doing is necessary so rather than wait, make a start on the data journey. Start simple and learn. (4 votes)

national data exchange platform to provide a single data market-place for government and private sector building a data economy and maximising transparency (3 votes)

Data transparency protocol - the same language and framework used everywhere (2 votes)

OPEN BUDGET DATA - show how peoples money is spent and what the outcomes are (2 votes)

Governments need to much better understand IoT and the implications on the entire economy. (2 votes)

gov. collab with private industry leaders to develop an adjustable but forward-thinking data usage & governance strategy. need to start somewhere and quick (2 votes)

national privacy enablement campaign for councils and government more broadly (1 votes)

Focus on outcomes over process. (1 votes)

national wellbeing program to understand the impact of projects. programs on citizen wellbeing (0 votes)

A more granular, sector by sector approach to define principles of good data stewardship, both practical and north star - then getting that talked about on the national agenda (0 votes)

Gov could put in place a consistent model for data sharing and risk assessment to get a common framework for all local governments. Without this we could have a rail gauge problem for digital (1 votes)

Actions

Now - National transparency guidelines (in OpenGov library?), agile/simple - resource about transparency? (0 votes)

New (0 votes)

Next - Australia's GDPR? (ALGA) (0 votes)

now - a vision for the whole country (0 votes)

Further Reading

To help us understand some of these critical issues further, we have identified a suite of articles from leading practitioners and policy advisers in this area, and hope you find them useful:

[*Why Social Data Matters for Cities: What It Is, and What It's Not*](#), by Lucinda Hartley, Co-Founder and Chief Innovation Officer – Neighbourlytics

[*Cities 4.0 - Privacy in the Age of Smart Cities*](#), by Nicole Stephensen, Principal Consultant - Ground Up Consulting

[*Going Beyond Open Data - Public Sector Transparency*](#), by Neil Glentworth, Director - Community Data

[*Good Data Practice: A Guide for Business to Consumer Internet of Things Services for Australia*](#), by the Internet of Things Alliance Australia

About us

Smart Cities Council Australia New Zealand (SCCANZ) is part of the Smart Cities Council, the world's largest network of smart cities companies, practitioners and policy makers, embracing technology, data and intelligent design to accelerate liveability, workability and sustainability in our cities and towns.

Further information about the Smart Cities Council can be found [here](#).

CONTACT US

Adam Beck
Executive Director
+61 (0) 422 496 043
adam.beck@anz.smartcitiescouncil.com
www.smartcitiescouncil.com
[@smartcitiesanz](#)

Smart**Cities**Council®
Australia New Zealand

